Indian Journal of History of Science, 48.2 (2013) 315-317

CORRESPONDENCES

The Violin and the Genesis of the Bose Institute

This refers to above paper of Probir K Bondyopadhayay and L Banerjee published in *IJHS,* 47.3(2012)427-472.

The authors have claimed in section 2.1 of the paper (p.432) that the violin's ancestor was *Ravanastron*, invented by King Ravana of Sri Lanka, which was brought to India by Hanuman, and over the years it travelled to Constantinople via Baghdad and finally reached Italy in the 16th century. The paper further states that Antonio Stradivari made major innovative improvements etc.

The references quoted by the authors for the above statements are questionable from a rigorous scientific or historical point of view. The one book quoted, namely "Chakravarti, 1951", is simply an English translation of Valmiki's *Rāmāyaṇa*, edited by C. Rajagopalachari and published by the Bharatiya Vidya Bhavan, Mumbai. Does *IJHS* accept this reference as good enough for this claim? The paper also states that Hanuman brought this ancestral instrument to India, where the multi-string and bow instrument was created. Where is the reference for this? Also Rajaji's *Rāmāyaṇa*? Does *IJHS* accept this as a scientifically valid source/reference?

The paper further states that the instrument travelled from India and reached Italy, and uses as reference Sara C. Bull's publication "Ole Bull- A Memoir (with Ole Bull's 'violin notes')" and the on-line source for it, and the pages there which are relevant. I accessed the site and attach below what has actually been written in those pages. As you will note, what is written there is what is believed to be traditions of antiquity (scientifically yet to be proved or disproved). Sara Bull states: "In music the violin may be traced back through a thousand varied forms until it finds its beginning in the *ravanastron*, or, as I have called it, the bas jo-fiddle of India". And she has provided no evidence for this, nor has she mentioned how the term *ravanastron* came about. Does *IJHS* accept this memoir of Bull as scientifically/historically rigorous reference?

The source is, in my opinion, not rigorous enough.

I am sorry to note that *IJHS*, has allowed this to happen, and I believe the authors should be requested to clarify and perhaps withdraw their claim unless they can provide scientifically.

D Balasubramanian
Director of Research,
L V Prasad Eye Institute,
Kallam Anji Reddy Campus,
L V Prasad Marg, Hyderabad
Email: dbala@lvpei.org

Mathematics and Mathematical Researches in India during Fifth to Twentieth Centuries: Profiles and Prospects

This refers to the above paper of AK Bag, published in *IJHS* 47.3 (2012) 473-512.

An important name missing from the West Zone (pp. 496-498) is that of (Late) Prof. Amit Roy (1940-2010) of TIFR. He worked in diverse fields of algebra. His seminal works on Quadratic Forms and Projective Modules opened up vigorous research in respective directions. His PhD student Prof. Satya Mandal, now in University of Kansas, is one of the important algebraists in the area of Projective Modules. The website https://sites.google.com/site/amitroy1940/gives further information about the wonderful personality and contributions of Prof. Amit Roy.

The following tributes by Profs H. Bass and T.Y. Lam will give an idea about the impact Prof Amit Roy had made in his time.

Hyman Bass:

"I was shocked and deeply saddened by the news in your message. Amit was at the center of my first visit to India, with my wife and two small children. Amit was the 'scribe' of my early lectures there on the then still emerging subject of algebraic K-theory. His notes were so much more elegant, and better organized, than my largely improvised lectures. But what always struck me about Amit, as much as the subtlety and lucidity of his thinking, were his personal qualities: gentleness, warmth, dignity, and a kind of spirituality. He deserved a kinder and more generous world than the one he sometimes had to endure. Though we saw little of each other in recent years,

each time I saw him, reminded me of the indelibility of our bond and friendship."

T.Y. Lam:

"Amit's passing was so very sad and sudden. His name was one of the earliest known to me from the modern Indian mathematical community. It was around the time I completed my Ph.D. when Professor Bass's "Lectures on Topics in Algebraic K-Theory" came out in the TIFR Publications (Vol. 41). Since this work predated even Professor Bass's Benjamin book on the subject, and was at that time one of the very few expository sources available on Azumaya algebras and Clifford algebras, it greatly infuenced my thinking in my post-doctoral years, and I read the book cover-to-cover. As is quite well-known, these notes were written by Amit Roy. I still remember that Professor Bass wrote in the preface: "The notes are often a considerable improvement on my lectures, and I express my warm thanks to Amit Roy who is responsible for them." In mathematics, knowing someone's writing is as large a part as knowing the man: in this sense I felt I have truly known Amit Roy San through all of my "adult" life in mathematics. Later, when I began to work more in quadratic form theory, it became clear to me that Amit's quadratic version of the cancellation theorem pretty much set the standard in generalizing Ernst Witt's work to commutative rings. Much later, in my Springer monograph on Serre's Problem, it was my great pleasure to refer to several of Amit's work in the early 1980s on projective modules and patching diagrams."

"Due to my rather limited travel schedule (which was apparently shared by Amit), our paths seldom crossed over the years, and I missed him even on my trip to the TIFR Conference in December of 2006. But I've felt a mathematical kinship to Amit all through these years, and was tremendously saddened to hear that he was taken from us by such a precipitous turn of events. From afar, I join his many admiring students and colleagues in mourning his passing – but also in celebrating his life which he so whole-heartedly devoted to mathematics.''

Amartya Kumar Datta
Professor in Mathematics
Indian Statistical Institute, Kolkata
Email: amartya.28@gmail.com